Abstract: The Nurul Fikri Study Guidance and Consultation Institute (BKB NF), as a business entity, must periodically conduct marketing audits and business strategies. This research (marketing audit) uses a quantitative approach to the case or object of research in the form of a Tutoring Education Institute. The object of research is the BKB NF Institute, with respondents from all levels of management / structural employees of BKB NF throughout Indonesia. The instrument in the form of Competitive Setting Profile (CSP) and Company Alignment Profile (CAP) questionnaires, distributed via google form. The questionnaire was filled in self-report / assessment using management judgment. Data analysis used the framework of Strategic Marketing Plus 2000. The results of calculations resulted in a CSI of 4.12, interpreted the competitive situation faced by the sophisticated stage BKB NF. CAI NF of 2.93, interpreted the existing marketing type of BKB NF is segmented marketing. CAI<CSI means that the existing marketing type lags 1.19 points compared to its competitive set. BKB NF must change its marketing type to niche marketing, including nine elements of strategy (segmentation, targeting, and positioning), tactics (differentiation, marketing mix, and selling), and value (brand, service, and process).

Keywords: audit marketing, Nurul Fikri, the strategic marketing plus 2000


Currently, the business world is very easy to experience a state that is full of turmoil (volatility), uncertainty, complexity, and ambiguity. Volatility is characterized by technological, political, economic, and even socio-cultural instability that ultimately affects industry, consumer behavior, and market competition. Uncertainty is shown by the increasing number of competitors and their creative and innovative actions in seizing, controlling and maintaining market share. Complexity is shown by customers that do not only believe in brand, but they trust other customers more by “asking questions and finding out” through family, friends, followers, and others. Ambiguity is characterized by the blurred reality that can trigger misunderstandings in a variety of conditions, including strategic decision making in businesses based on limited understanding.

Moreover, consumers are increasingly enlightened and empowered. The connectivity among consumers is getting stronger. They share information,
recommend some products along with reviews, word-of-mouth, social media and so on.

The unexpected changes in the business environment and internal dynamics require business organizations such as Nurul Fikri Tutoring Center to review the changes in the business environment and redesign their business strategies periodically. Marketing audits can be an option for promoting their business or marketing strategy. Since established in 1985, Nurul Fikri Tutoring Center has never conducted a formal marketing audit. Moreover, currently the number of its students in all its operational areas in Indonesia is decreasing. Miller (1990) in Kartajaya (2002), shows the importance of conducting audits a company, mostly for companies that are experiencing growth decline. According to Kotler and Keller (2007), marketing audit is an examination of environment, objectives, strategies, and marketing activities of a company or business unit systematically, independently, and periodically. It aims to determine the areas in question and potential plan to improve the marketing performance of the company.

A marketing audit can be started internally by the department at Nurul Fikri Tutoring Center, as stated by McDonald and Keegan, (1999) that marketing audit is a formal and systematic review of marketing strategies and plans that can be carried out externally by the auditor independently or internally (carried out by the company itself). The purpose of a marketing audit is to see how well the company applies its marketing concept and creating value for its customers (in terms of profit level). Researchers have categorized the components of marketing audit and advocated the use of several tools or instruments to carry out marketing audits, such as structured questionnaires and checklists (guided checklists) containing diagnostic and comprehensive questions. These tools can be combined with other supporting tools or analysis, such as PEST analysis, SWOT analysis, BCG Matrix, Five Force’s Matrix, Strategic Marketing Plus 2000, and so on. This study prefers to use Strategic Marketing Plus 2000 to obtain the profile of external business environment (competitive setting), which includes customers, companies, and competitors, while internal management profile consists of strategy, tactics, and values. The profile referred to is called Competitive Setting Profile (CSP) and the Company Alignment Profile (CAP).

Nurul Fikri Study Tutoring Center (starting now abbreviated to BKB NF) is one of institutions/ com-

![Figure 1 Number of students in Megapolitan TP 2012/2013 to 2018/2019](image)
Marketing Audit Of Educational Service Company

companies providing non-formal education services. It is commonly known as tutoring institution. One of the problems faced today is the continuing decline in sales in its operational areas. Figure 1 presents a graph of the decline in sales.

The competition in the tutoring center industry is also increasingly dynamic and intensive. It is characterized by the increasing number of tutoring institutions, more aggressive competition, and increasingly competitive capabilities. The competition in this industry is increasing in the industrial revolution 4.0 (disruption era) which helped bring change into the world of education. Disruptive waves in education include on-demand educational services and skills, open-source educational services and skills, educational applications that are mobile and responsive, curriculum that is more personal and tailor-made, limitless content services, collaborative education platforms, and free online courses and materials (Kasali 2017). Based on the description above, the purpose of this study is to identify the competitive settings currently faced by BKB NF; analyze marketing strategies, tactics and values carried out by BKB NF; and formulate strategies, tactics and marketing values that are compatible with the competitive settings faced by BKB NF for the next three years.

The operational framework of this study is made as a general research overview. It is presented in Figure 2.

---

**Figure 2 Research Framework**
METHOD

This research used a quantitative approach to study the case or object of research in the form of a Tutoring Center. The quantitative approach is a method that is based on the use of numbers, starting from data collection, analysis, and appearance of study results (Arikunto 2013). Craswell (1998) in Herdiansyah (2014) stated that case study is a model that emphasizes the exploration of a “bounded system” in one case or several cases in detail, accompanied by deep data exploration involving a variety of sources of information that have rich context. This research was conducted at BKB NF throughout Indonesia during March-April 2019.

The object of this research is BKB NF, and the respondents are all management/structural staff in central as well as regional BKB NF who are competent or have sufficient knowledge in marketing. The respondents would reveal their opinions and assessments of issues related to the company, customers, competitors, and changes in the business of tutoring center and or involved in marketing activities and the formulation of marketing strategies.

Table 1 Number and Distribution of Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Central Office</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Director</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Regional Manager</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Field Manager</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Assistant Regional Manager</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Head of Sub Division</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Senior Administration Staff</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spv. Creative Marketing Team</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>CMT Staff</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Module Developer</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>PJ Learning Location</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Test Developer</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>Teacher (Promotion Support)</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher Developer</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assistant Developer</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior Administration Staff</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>62</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>257</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data was collected by distributing instruments/questionnaires via Google form. The instrument consisted of a Competitive Setting Profile (CSP) and Company Alignment Profile (CAP) questionnaire. CSP and CAP questionnaires were filled using a subjective and qualitative management judgment. Competitive Setting Profile (CSP) and Company Alignment Profile (CAP) questionnaires were filled in by respondents independently (self-report/assessment).

The data analysis technique carried out in this competitive audit is based on the framework of Strategic Marketing Plus 2000. To represent this audit, two profiles were prepared, namely Competitive Setting Profile (CSP) and Company Alignment Profile (CAP). CSP consists of three factors, namely customer demand, competitors, and change drivers, and CAP is a profile formed after completing audits of the company’s strategy, tactics, and values. A gap analysis was done by comparing the indexes of the two profiles, namely Competitive Setting Index (CSI) and the Company Alignment Index (CAI), then the competitive position of BKB NF was compared to the competitive level of the tutoring industry.

This marketing audit is conducted internally. The advantage is that the auditors can get deep understanding of a company’s marketing situation and the possibility of conducting ongoing and regular audits. However, there are some limitations. Limitations of this study include, the respondents involved have not fully met the criteria of an ‘auditor’ who is truly...
able to act as management judgment; even respondents from management/structural employees may not necessarily understand and comprehend the concepts of marketing management/strategic marketing/audit marketing; questionnaires that are filled in independently (self-report/self-assessment) without an interview with the respondent opens the opportunity for the respondent not to answer the questions in accordance with the facts for a variety of reasons; limited electronic questionnaires used, that any doubts that respondents might have could not be clarified.

RESULTS

The target number of respondents was 319 people (100%); respondents who responded to the questionnaire sent were 154 people (48.28%). The number of respondents who responded represents all structural management or employees in BKB NF because the top and middle-management at the Central and Regional level were Sector Managers, Head of Subdivision, Regional Managers, and Assistant Regional Managers (36 people). All of them (100%) responded to the questionnaires sent. Most of the respondents are men (142 people or 84.52%), while the number of women was 12 people (7.14%). Based on age group, respondents were dominated by 31-40 years old (58 people or 37.67%), followed by 21-30 years old (47 people or 30.52%), 41-50 years old (40 people or 25.97%), and 51-60 years old (9 people or 5.84%). In terms of education level, most of respondents were graduates of S1 or Bachelor’s degree (117 people or 75.97%), followed by high school (15 people or 9.74%), S2 or Master’s degree (11 people (7.14%), D3 or diploma (10 people or 6.49%), and S3 or Doctoral degree (1 person or 0.65%). In terms of experience, the work experience of most respondents is 6-15 years (67 people or 43.51%), less than 1-5 years (45 people or 29.22%), 16-25 years (31 people or 20.13%), and 26-35 years (11 people or 7.14%).

Competitive audit of BKB NF was started by calculating the standard deviation of Competitive Setting Index (CSI) and the components of CSI. The standard deviation of CSI and its components was calculated to test the agreement or similarity of opinion among respondents regarding the topic in question. The results of the calculation of the standard deviation of CSI and CSI BKB NF are presented in Table 2.

Table 2 shows the calculation results of the standard deviation of the components of the Competitive Setting Index (CSI) as follows: CSI - Customer 0.03; CSI - Competitor 0.03; and CSI - Change 0.05. The standard deviation scores of all CSI components are below 0.5, meaning that there are similar opinions of all respondents about the topic (three CSI components), namely C1 (customer), C2 (competitor), and C3 (change). The standard deviation of Competitive Setting Index (CSI) of BKB NF is 0.31, which is below 0.5. It is within the acceptable range, meaning that there is consistency between C1 (customer), C3 (competitor), and C4 (change) in the competitive setting faced by BKB NF.

Furthermore, Competitive Setting Index (CSI) was calculated to analyze and conclude the current competitive situation faced by BKB NF for the next three years, which is classified into five categories, namely Competitive Setting 2C - Stable; Competi-
The Competitive Setting Index (CSI) score of BKB NF shown in Table 3 is 4.12. It indicates that the competitive situation (competitive setting) faced by BKB NF up to the next three years is “sophisticated”.

The process of the competitive audit was continued by calculating the standard deviation of the CAI (Company Alignment Index) components. CAI was carried out to test the agreement or the similarity of the respondents’ opinions on the topic being asked, which is related to the company’s strategy, tactic, and value (existing) and the consistency of strategy, tactics, and values carried out by BKB NF with its marketing types. The calculation results of CAI standard deviations and CAI components are presented in Table 4.

The calculation results of the standard deviation of Company Alignment Index (CAI) components presented in Table 4 are as follows: CAI - Strategy 0.30; CAI - Tactic 0.05; and CAI - Value 0.37. The standard deviation scores indicate that all CAI components are equal to or below 0.5. It means that the respondents had the same understanding of strategy, tactics, and values carried out by BKB NF. The standard deviation score of the Company Alignment Index (CAI) of BKB NF is 0.34, which is below 0.5. It means that it is still within the acceptable range, indicating that the strategy, tactics, and values carried out by BKB NF are consistent or complementary.

The next step was calculating Company Alignment Index (CAI). Table 5 presents the calculation results that produce the Company Alignment Index (CAI) of the existing BKB NF.

Table 5 shows that the score of BKB NF CAI amounted to 2.93. It can be concluded that the type of marketing which is currently carried out by BKB NF is classified as “segmented marketing”. Interpretation is carried out on strategy (segmentation, targeting, and positioning); tactic (differentiation, marketing mix, and selling); and value (brand, process, and service) as marketing elements applied (existing) according to the type of marketing “segmented marketing”.

The last step was calculating gap analysis by comparing the CSI score of 4.12 and CAI score of 2.93. It shows that CAI < CSI with a difference of
1.19 points. This means that the type of marketing carried out by BKB NF lags 1.19 points behind to the competitive situation it currently faces for the next three years.

DISCUSSION

The score of Competitive Setting Index (CSI) of BKB NF presented in Table 3 above is 4.12. It indicates that competition (competitive setting) being faced by BKB NF for the next three years is “sophisticated”. A sophisticated competition is characterized by customer shift to “clients”, wild competitors, and discontinuous change drivers. Clients must be treated as clients who should get extra care than regular customers because they have better relationships with institutions. They do not move to another institution easily because there are more customers in the niche market. The wild competitor will do everything to seize, maintain and dominate the market share by creating and carrying out marketing strategies that are very different from conventional strategies and better than the competitors’. Competitors do not only produce substitute products/services, but they also create new-generation products/services, for example online lessons that are currently booming and potential to replace onsite lessons. Discontinuous change means that the changes that occur are not in a certain pattern so that it requires reverse thinking or upside-down thinking. Past information to predict the future cannot be used anymore, because the future seems to have no connection with the past.

CAI provides conclusions about the type of marketing which is currently carried out by BKB NF. Types of marketing are categorized into several groups, starting from ‘No Marketing’, ‘Mass Marketing’, ‘Segmented Marketing’, ‘Niche Marketing’, to ‘Individualized Marketing’. Of course, different types of marketing have different strategies, tactics, and values. Table 6 shows that the CAI score of BKB NF amounted to 2.93. It can be concluded that the type of marketing carried out by BKB NF currently is segmented marketing. The interpretation was carried out on strategy (segmentation, targeting, and positioning), tactic (differentiation, marketing mix, and selling), and value (brand, process, and service) as marketing elements that are applied (existing) to segmented marketing.

The first interpretation was made on strategy (segmentation, targeting, and positioning). BKB NF applies a psychographic segmentation strategy. They target the middle-class market segment of Muslims who, in addition to being concerned with excellent products and services, are also very concerned about the spiritual aspects of each product and service they use. Usually, this group of potential customers is not satisfied with their children’s school services. They think their children are not ready to face a variety of exams at school, such as exams to higher levels of education.

They hope that their children get better academic achievement, and do a variety of examinations at schools successfully, including national exams. They also hope that their children will be accepted in excellent Junior High School, excellent High School, and favorite State University besides Islamic learning environment and material. BKB NF applies its targeting strategy by choosing people (chosen ones) only in the market segments that are considered the most effective as the target market. Therefore, the target market should be determined first, followed by making the product.
The most effective market segments and are grade 4, 5, 6 elementary schools; 7, 8, 9 junior high school; 10, 11, 12 high schools; and High School Alumni. BKB NF applies its positioning strategy by issuing one statement showing that it is different from other companies. BKB NF’s tag line is “Join NF Before You Enroll in Excellent Junior High School”. It is one of their tactics (differentiation, marketing mix, and selling). It also applies to senior high school as well as state university.

Tactic differentiation was conducted by organizing all aspects of the company’s operations so that customers prefer to use their service. BKB NF always checks the shift of the preferences of its consumers/ customers and gives the impression that they will meet the needs of their consumers/ customers. In terms of content (what is offered), BKB NF ensures that all of their instructors are graduates of favorite State University. They have been trained systemically. In addition, they provide flexible syllabus, complete modules and teaching materials, paper-based test services ( paper-based test), computer-based test, and online test. Monitoring and student attendance reports were conducted via Android-based applications and websites, reports on learning progress was delivered via Academic Information System (SAI), which can be accessed via the website or application, free student consultation services outside of class hours both on-site (at the class) and via social media (telegram and WhatsApp), character education content is taught through the Educational Guidance and Information (BIP) material, matrix which helps students select departments they will enroll in state universities (MBPJ PTN), and Service recommendations for selection of majors or study programs in various selection of entrance into State Universities (PTN). In the context of (service), BKB NF offers products/ services differently than their competitors, for example, Islamic learning atmosphere, basic concepts of learning, competent, friendly, and fun teachers. They apply Four Quadrant Learning Strategy, which means that the questions asked in enrollment test of various state universities are classified into several groups, starting from K1 (easy and frequent), K2 (relatively difficult and frequent), K3 (relatively easy and rare), and K4 (difficult and rare). Infrastructure (as an enabler) involves technology, facilities, and employees that are used to create content and context, including all classes are equipped with LCD TVs, Academic Information Systems (SIA) and e-Learning in the form of video learning materials, video of problem solving, and Online Try Out (TO) via NFJuara application, the Nurul Fikri Bimbel Application, which is mobile-based is available in Playstore, scholarships (learning program and college), lending college textbook, for participants enrolled at state university. BKB NF runs a marketing mix tactic called “4P” (“Product, Price, Place and Promotion”) and integrally regulates 4Ps in accordance with the marketing strategy set by the company. BKB NF applies the selling tactic to its consumers. They sell the benefits of their products/ services (benefit selling). The benefits offered by BKB NF to consumers include learning with competent and qualified teachers, get free study consulting services, get educational information guidance services (BIP), getting recommendations via the Department Selection Matrix (MBPJ), get scholarships, and post-study services.

The third interpretation was carried out on the values (brand, process, and service) offered/ implemented by BKB NF so far. The value brand offered by BKB NF is to impress consumers (brand association). Most consumers associate BKB NF with the University of Indonesia, ‘Islamic tutoring’, quality tutoring at affordable prices for all groups, and so on. Research conducted by Frontier and Marketing Magazine every year always puts BKB NF as top of mind awareness. Its Top Brand Index (TBI) is always above 10%, so that it is categorized as the TOP brand, which is the main brand of various brands in Indonesia in various segments (both teens and kids). Value service offered by BKB NF is already in the stage of value-in-use (providing useful extras for consumers), such as providing consulting services outside of study hours for free, material consulting services for students electronically via social media such as telegrams and WhatsApp, recommendation and consultation services in selecting majors/ study programs at various State University (PTN).
The value process implemented at BKB NF is “functional streamlining” in its process value, in three ways, reducing people from each layer (function), so there is no waste (cost reduction) so that it is more competitive and more agile; automating using machines or computers to replace the function of several people; applying matrix organizational model (one person has two superiors, namely functional superiors and operational superiors) is carried out in the Creative Marketing Team (CMT) work unit which is functionally under the organizational field, but structurally it is under the Regional Manager.

The next stage of the marketing audit (competitive audit) was comparing CSI scores with CAI. CSI score amounted to 4.12, while CAI score amounted to 2.93, meaning that CAI <CSI with a difference of 1.19 points. The type of marketing carried out by BKB NF lags 1.19 points behind the current competitive situation it faces for the next three years.

Based on the results of the competitive audit at BKB NF Institute, The Strategic Marketing Plus 2000 Conceptual Framework recommends that BKB NF should change the type of marketing from segmented marketing to niche marketing. BKB NF should change its marketing strategy, tactic and value elements to fit the type of marketing called “niche marketing”.

BKB NF should change the psychographic segmentation strategy to behavioral segmentation strategy. They should apply segmentation strategies based on behavioral variables such as user status, loyalty levels, and so on; change the targeting strategy from “chosen ones” to “a few goods ones”, meaning that they should look for potential niches or niche markets with a target (it can be one or several niches). Niche is considered as a collection of “a few good ones” (the company chooses only a few people, but the chosen person is potential); change the positioning strategy from “one statement” to “different ones”, meaning that they offer different statements from before (the different ones) in order to “get out of the crowd”.

BKB NF should change its differentiation tactics from “preferred by customers” to “specialized for niches”, meaning that they should provide products or services that are unique, different, and specifically designed for potential customers who become specific niche markets (“specialized for niches”); change marketing mix tactics from 4P (Product, Price, Place, and Promotion) to 4V (Variety, Value, Venue, and Voice), which offers a variety of products/services to various heterogeneous market fragments (variety), pricing considering the actual value received by consumers (value), the learning place is well prepared for each market fragment (venue), promotion is not one-way, the customer’s input is increasingly considered by the company (voice of customer); change the selling tactics from “benefit selling” to “solution selling”, meaning that they should offer/sell their products/services that provide solutions to consumers’ problems. It is more than just providing service and benefits. In addition, they should convince their consumers that it understands problems faced by the consumers and they can provide a solution.

BKB NF should change their brand value from “brand association” to “perceived quality”, meaning that they should ensure that the product/service is high quality (perceived quality) in various aspects: performance, appearance, comfort, reliability, durability, efficiency, and the final result; change the value service from “value in use business” to “customer satisfying business”, meaning that their service should satisfy their customers. Everyone in the company, at each level, should provide service as an “important principle” in the concept of “customer satisfaction”; change the value process from “functional streamlining” to “total delivery reengineering”. In the context of quality, the process should create a system that can provide more value to consumers. In the context of cost, the process should improve financial efficiency while maintaining the best quality for consumers. In the context of delivery, process is delivering/performing services appropriately and correctly to satisfy consumers.

BKB NF should change the form of its company to Specialist or Market Driven. The competitive situation faced by BKB NF is sophisticated. It requires a specialist or market-driven company. The company that has divided segmented market into sub-segments is called fragments or niches. A mar-
ket niche is a small group in a market that has unique and profitable needs for products/services.

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Conclusions

Competitive settings faced by BKB NF for the next three years are sophisticated. It is characterized by customer shifting (C1) to client, wild competitors (C3), and discontinuous change driver (C4). The type of marketing called "existing" is segmented marketing, which is relatively left behind. It is a competitive setting. BKB NF’s marketing strategies, tactics, and value for the next three years should be changed according to niche marketing. The type of company that fits sophisticated competition is a company that is in the stage of specialist or market-driven.

Recommendations

Things that need to study further, especially to fix the weakness in this research are:

- Ensuring that respondents involved in research meet the criteria needed by 'auditor' and understand the marketing management/strategic marketing/audit marketing concepts of the company so they can act as management judgment.
- Completing research instruments and techniques, not only self-report/self-assessment questionnaires, but also equipped with in-depth interviews, and conducting focus group discussions (FGD).
- The research is continued by using a much more comprehensive model, the Sustainable Marketing Enterprise (SME) model. SME consists of Sustainable (a tool to understand the company's position in its sustainability loop); Marketing that can be viewed according to three strategic dimensions (Outlook, Architecture, and Scorecard) and Enterprise (tools for the company’s Vision, Mission, Goal, Business Scope, Corporate Culture, Organization, Target, Balance, Result).

REFERENCES


Marketing Audit Of Educational Service Company


