COGNITIVE-AFFECTIVE ASPECTS OF FORMING BRAND LOYALTY

Mardhatillah Shanti
Master in Management Program, Faculty of Economic and Business, Universitas Brawijaya

Sunaryo
Ainur Rofiq
Faculty of Economic and Business, Universitas Brawijaya

Abstract: This study has the aims to determine both direct and indirect effects of brand experience, brand satisfaction, brand love and brand loyalty to Wardah cosmetic’s consumers in Malang City. 160 samples were taken by using the nonprobability approach with purposive sampling technique. Data was collected through questionnaires and analyzed using SmartPLS 3.0. Respondents were above 15 years of age and had bought and used Wardah cosmetics more than once. The result found that brand experience has no significant effect on brand loyalty. Furthermore, brand satisfaction and brand love are found as a full mediation to the effect of brand experience on brand loyalty. For further research are recommended to use more than one cosmetic brand as the object of the research, to provide more representative results.

Keywords: Brand Experience, Brand Satisfaction, Brand Love, Brand Loyalty

Nowadays, the cosmetics industry is one industry that has succeeded in leading the domestic market and is growing rapidly in the modern era. Consumer needs for cosmetics are increasingly high because the function of cosmetics is no longer only a makeup tool but also serves as a therapy to help improve physical performance. Local cosmetic sales have increased every year, with an average growth of 9.67%. In fact, in 2017, the local cosmetics industry showed a growth of 20% or four times the national economic growth in 2017 (National Cosmetic Industry Grows 20%, 2018). All of these facts show that local cosmetics experience positive sales growth every year, but a survey from nielsen.com in 2016 showed that 48% of Indonesian consumers still like the cosmetics of global brands. The orientation of upper middle class consumers is still focused on imported cosmetic brands which are believed to use quality and quality raw materials (Aldila, 2016). Seeing this is important for every local cosmetic company to create loyalty to have a competitive advantage and can survive in the long term.

One of the local cosmetics brands that are currently trying to create loyalty amid competitive com-
petition is Wardah. Wardah is one of the cosmetics brands issued by PT. Paragon Technology and Innovation and have been produced since 1995. Researchers are interested in making Wardah an object in this study because Wardah can survive as a market leader amid the dominance of foreign products in the local market. Wardah can control around 30% of the cosmetics or makeup market segment in Indonesia. Among other local brands, Wardah has also gained popularity among women from all groups, especially women, who focus on halal products.

In general, Wardah has won the trust of consumers to become the local market leader. However, Wardah realizes that a way is needed to stay afloat and continue to be of interest to consumers in the face of increasingly competitive competition, both for local and foreign brands. Wardah needs a specific strategy to be able to increase consumer loyalty to its brand. Wardah needs brand loyalty as a mechanism to survive in the market and become a competitive advantage for Wardah companies.

The brand loyalty of consumer to Wardah is shown by a series of prestigious awards received by Wardah. Some Wardah products have been trusted to receive the TOP Brand Award in Indonesia for five consecutive years and become the top leader for each category. These achievements beat the toughest competitors called Revlon, which began to decline every year.

One of Wardah’s strategies to effectively build brand loyalty is the use of experience. Consumer relations with brands give rise to internal responses and behavioral responses obtained from brand-related stimuli (Sahin, et al., 2012). These stimuli are in the form of parts of the design, brand identity, packaging, communication, and environment that consumers get from looking for information about brands to buying, to consuming products from these brands (Brakus, et al., 2009). If consumers get a positive experience from Wardah, the more positive it is to form brand loyalty towards Wardah.

The relationship of brand experience on brand loyalty empirically has been proven by several previous studies which stated that brand experience has a direct and significant influence on brand loyalty. The more positive experience gained by consumers of the brand will affect the level of consumer loyalty to the brand. Although some of these studies show that brand experience has a significant relationship to brand loyalty, there are gaps in research conducted by Iglesias, et al. (2011), Maffezzolli, et al. (2014) and Kim & Yu (2016). The overall results of these studies indicate that brand experience is not enough to generate brand loyalty, an intermediary is needed that can strengthen the relationship.

The inconsistency of research results is interesting to research other variables that are predicted to be able to better explain the relationship between the influence of brand experience on brand loyalty. Based on the phenomenon described above, the researcher uses the variable brand satisfaction and brand love as mediating variables which are predicted to strengthen consumer relations with the Wardah brand.

The experience of the brand raises a series of effective responses such as emotions known as consumption emotions pleasure or satisfaction, relaxation or action, and passion or excitement (Ali, et al., 2016). Satisfaction is a positive reaction from affective responses that arise after going through the experience. Satisfaction is one of the important aspects of buying behavior. When consumers feel their needs and expectations are fulfilled after having a positive experience from Wardah, it will bring satisfaction to the Wardah brand. The more consumers are satisfied with the Wardah brand, the more customer loyalty to Wardah is. Therefore, researchers use variable brand satisfaction as one of the mediating variables that are predicted to mediate brand experience relationships with brand loyalty.

Carrol and Ahuvia (2006) revealed that brand love is an important affective aspect in building strong customer relationships with brands. When consumers get a positive experience from the brand, it will bring out a sense of emotional and deep passion for the brand. These feelings are in the form of love, where consumers feel confident and passionate about choosing and using brands. The deeper the love that consumers have towards Wardah, the greater the level of consumer loyalty to Wardah will
be. Therefore, researchers use the variable brand love as one of the mediating variables predicted to mediate the brand experience relationship with brand loyalty.

This study aims to determine how the influence of brand experience on brand loyalty. Furthermore, researchers want to know how the role of brand satisfaction and brand love in mediating the relationship in the cosmetic context. The use of cosmetics as well as choosing the Wardah brand as an object in this study is relatively new because most of the studies that examine the effect of brand experience variables on brand loyalty choose objects with premium category brands.

**Literature review**

**Brand Experience**

The brand experience has attracted a lot of attention in marketing practices. Brakus, et al. (2009) defines brand experience as a consumer’s internal response (sensation, feeling, cognition) subjectively and behavioral responses that arise as a result of brand-related stimuli. These stimuli are part of brand design and identity (identification of brand colors, shapes, product design backgrounds, slogans, logos, and brand characters), packaging, marketing communications (advertisements, brochures, websites), and the environment in which the brand is marketed or sold (shop or events). Schmitt (1999) measures brand experience into four dimensions that are sensory, affective, intellectual, and behavioral.

**Brand Satisfaction**

Satisfaction has been found as a decisive aspect of the quality of long-term customer relationships with a product (brand relationship quality). Satisfaction is one of the positive reactions of affective responses to purchasing situations (Sahin, et al., 2011). Satisfaction is the feeling of being happy or disappointed someone who emerges from the results of a comparison of perceived product performance (results) with expectations (Kotler and Keller, 2012).

Oliver (1999) measured satisfaction by dividing it into three dimensions that are fulfillment, pleasure, and ambivalence. Fulfillment is related to satisfaction due to fulfilled consumer needs. Pleasure relates to feeling happy as a result of the service of a product that makes consumers feel good or related to happiness whereas ambivalence is related to satisfaction when there is a combination of positive and negative experiences related to the product or service.

**Brand Love**

The concept of love is now gaining greater attention from marketing practitioners. Creating quality customer relationships with brands requires affective aspects in the form of emotional bonds and strong motivation. Love brands have a strong focus to affective aspects. Love is an emotional aspect of the long-term behavior of relationships between consumers and brands (Turgut and Gultekin, 2015).

Some researchers adopted brand love measurements using the theory of Sternberg’s (1986), which divides brand love into three dimensions such as intimacy, passion, and commitment. Intimacy comes from someone’s emotional if the relationship with the brand is a feeling of mutual understanding between consumers and brands. Passion relates to the analysis and response of consumers to the needs and behavior to meet those needs. Whereas, commitment is related to consumer behavior and decisions to maintain long-term feelings of love in consumer relations with brands.

**Brand Loyalty**

Post-purchase behavior is something that needs to be considered by every company. Loyalty is a post-purchase behavior that is one of the company’s main strategies in obtaining long-term benefits. The concept of loyalty is measured based on attitudinal and behavioral approaches (Zeithaml, et al., 1996). The attitude shows the overall consumer perception of the brand, while the behavior shows the intention to buy back and recommend the brand to others. Then Oliver (1999) deepens the analysis of consumer attitudes into four phases that are cognitive loyalty, effective loyalty, conative loyalty, and action loyalty. The conative phase is based on con-
Consumer evaluations of the performance level of a brand’s attributes. Then, an effective attitude begins to develop. Consumers like brands due to accumulated satisfaction with high attribute performance. Furthermore, consumers begin to lead to the commitment stage to buy the same brand (conative). Finally, consumers begin to be willing to do loyalty (action) so that it creates behavior.

**H1 Brand experience has a significant effect on brand loyalty**

Brakus, et al. (2009), stated that brand experience is the strongest predictor in determining purchasing behavior, specifically related to brand loyalty. Khan & Rahman (2015) explained that if consumers get a pleasant brand experience can help grow brand loyalty. When consumers get a positive experience from a brand, the level of consumer loyalty to the brand also increases.

**H2 Brand experience has a significant effect on brand satisfaction**

Satisfaction is included in a series of emotional responses known as consumption emotions that arise due to the experience of a brand (Ali, et al., 2016). Positive brand experience tends to produce positive emotional and cognitive conditions, which ultimately lead to psychological satisfaction with the brand consumed (Chinomona, 2013). Brands that have managed to provide different experiences to consumers will have an impact on the growth of satisfaction in the minds of consumers (Sidhabutar & Dharmayanti, 2013).

**H3 Brand experience has a significant effect on brand love**

Experience is one of the factors that can encourage consumer emotional attachment to the brand. Consumers who have positive experiences with brands reinforce the emotional feelings (love) of consumers towards the brand (Biçakcioğlu, et al., 2016). Consumers know what they need and expect from a brand, then involve the integration of the brand into consumer identity, resulting in high emotional arousal towards the brand.

**H4 Brand satisfaction has a significant effect on brand loyalty**

Customer satisfaction is a determinant that has a significant influence on consumer loyalty (Ali, et al., 2016). Consumers who are satisfied with the performance of the product or service provided will return to using the brand and will recommend it to other consumers. Customer satisfaction is a factor that significantly influences consumer loyalty both directly and indirectly (Tu, et al., 2012). Research conducted by Sahin, et al. (2011) also shows that brand satisfaction has a positive and significant influence on brand loyalty.

**H5 Brand love has a significant effect on brand loyalty**

The concept of brand relationship quality (consumer brand relationship) in consumer relations with brands (consumer brand relationship) shows that emotional is one aspect that can affect consumer loyalty to the brand. The consumer’s love of the
brand can lead to strong loyalty compared to the loyalty that arises if there is no emotional feeling in it. If consumers love a brand, then the desire of consumers to use, the willingness to invest resources to buy a brand, and consumer loyalty to use the brand will be even greater.

**H6 Brand satisfaction can mediate the influence of brand experience on the brand loyalty**

Brands that have managed to provide positive experiences to consumers will have an impact on the growth of satisfaction in the minds of consumers. Consumers who are satisfied with the performance of the product or service provided will return to using the brand and will recommend to other consumers. Previous research conducted by Chinomona (2013); Nysveen, et al. (2014); Sahin, et al. (2014); Sidhabutar & Dharmayanti (2013), and Walter, et al. (2013) have proven that there is a positive and significant direct influence between brand experience and brand satisfaction. Ali, et al. (2016); Nysveen, et al. (2014); Sahin, et al. (2011); and Tu, et al. (2012) have also proven that brand satisfaction has a positive and significant influence on brand loyalty.

**H7 Brand love can mediate the influence of brand experience on brand loyalty**

Consumers who have positive experiences with brands reinforce the emotional feelings (love) of consumers towards the brand (Biçakcioğlu, et al., 2016). The consumer’s love of the brand can lead to strong loyalty compared to the loyalty that arises if there is no emotional feeling in it. Previous research conducted by Biçakcioğlu, et al., (2016); Huang, (2017); and Roy, et al., (2012) have proven that there is a direct influence between consumer experience and consumer love for a brand. Research conducted by Carrol and Ahuvia (2006); Chen & Quester, (2015); Drennan., Et al (2015); Khamwon and Niyomsart, (2016); and Biçakcioğlu, et al., (2016) also prove that consumer love for brands positively and significantly influences consumer loyalty to the brand.

**METHOD**

This study uses a quantitative approach and is included in explanatory research. The study was conducted by distributing questionnaires aimed at all Wardah cosmetic users in Malang. The number of samples used was 160 samples with criteria over the age of 15 years (The History of Paragon, 2013) and had buying experience while using Wardah brand cosmetics in any category more than once (Walter, et al., 2013). Data was measured using a Likert scale and analyzed using SmartPLS 3.0.

**RESULT**

**Hypothesis Testing Results**

The results of the hypothesis analysis for each path obtained by using smartPLS3.0 software are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relation between variable</th>
<th>Path Coefficient</th>
<th>t- statistics</th>
<th>p-value</th>
<th>Note</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Brand Experience</td>
<td>Brand Loyalty</td>
<td>0.072</td>
<td>0.901</td>
<td>Not significant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brand Experience</td>
<td>Brand Satisfaction</td>
<td>0.839</td>
<td>37.291</td>
<td>significant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brand Experience</td>
<td>Brand Love</td>
<td>0.779</td>
<td>9.443</td>
<td>significant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brand Satisfaction</td>
<td>Brand Loyalty</td>
<td>0.276</td>
<td>3.668</td>
<td>significant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brand Love</td>
<td>Brand Loyalty</td>
<td>0.579</td>
<td>7.092</td>
<td>significant</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: SmartPLS3.0 processed data (2019)
The results of the hypothesis test for direct effect in table 1 shows that the first hypothesis is rejected. That is, brand experience does not have a significant effect on brand loyalty because of the value of t-statistics <1.96 and p-value <0.05. The other four hypotheses show the results of the t-statistics> 1.96 and the p-value <0.05, in other words, the four hypotheses are accepted. So it can be concluded that brand experience influences brand satisfaction and brand love, where both variables also influence brand loyalty.

**Mediation Test Results**

**Table 2** Results of Hypothesis Mediation Test Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relation</th>
<th>Path Coefficient</th>
<th>t-count</th>
<th>Note</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>brand experience → brand satisfaction → brand loyalty</td>
<td>0.231</td>
<td>3.662</td>
<td>significant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>brand experience → brand love → brand loyalty</td>
<td>0.451</td>
<td>5.667</td>
<td>significant</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: SmartPLS3.0 processed data (2019)

Table 2 shows that the two mediating variables have a value of t-statistics > 1.96, meaning that brand satisfaction and brand love can mediate the relationship of the influence of brand experience on brand loyalty significantly. Both of these variables act as full mediation because, without brand satisfaction or brand love, the brand experience relationship with brand loyalty does not have a significant effect.

**DISCUSSION**

**The influence of brand experience on brand loyalty**

The results of this study indicate that brand experience does not have a significant effect on brand loyalty. In other words, consumer experience is not able to directly influence consumer loyalty to Wardah’s cosmetics brand. The results of this study contrast with the results of previous studies conducted by Brakus, et al (2009), Sahin, et al (2011), Nysveen, et al (2013), Walter, et al (2013), Kim, et al (2015 ) and Naggar and Bendary (2017).

The findings in this study are in line with the research of Iglesias, et al. (2011), Maffezzolli, et al. (2014) and Kim & Yu (2016). The experience received by consumers from the Wardah brand has not been able to create consumer loyalty to the Wardah brand directly. The results of this study clarify the theory of C-A-B (Cognition-Affect-Behavior) paradigm proposed by Holbrook & Brata (1987). Consumer behavior will be formed if it is influenced by cognitive aspects, which then form affective aspects as aspects that provide quality in consumer relations with the brand. Brand experience as a cognitive aspect, where consumers receive and process all information about the brand obtained from knowledge and experience to be evaluated (Brakus, et al., 2009). The results of this study illustrate that to raise consumer loyalty to Wardah is not only based on the results of consumer evaluations of Wardah. During the evaluation process, consumers involve feelings or consumer psychology, such as positive or negative emotions and moods, known as affective aspects (Kim, et al., 2013). It is this effective aspect that provides quality in a relationship that can be the next consumer step, namely whether consumers will buy products, buy back products or even switch to other products (Holbrook & Brata, 1987).

The results of the frequency distribution of respondents’ answers to the item brand experience statement showed that as many as 69.4% of respondents agreed to have positive experiences from the Wardah brand. Using the Wardah brand provides a good experience for respondents.
Cognitive-Affective Aspects of Forming Brand Loyalty

Respondent’s brand experience was formed from Wardah’s identity which had a strong impression on the respondent’s eyes, Wardah’s packaging that was unique and different from competitors gave rise to its stimulus for consumers, and Wardah’s principles, Wardah Inspiring Beauty, could lead to positive emotional consumerism towards the Wardah brand, so that all information obtained respondents about Wardah increased their curiosity. However, the results of this study indicate that all positive evaluations of experience that respondents can from Wardah have not been able to bring them to be loyal to the brand. Positive evaluations about Wardah are influenced by affective aspects, namely satisfaction, and love for the Wardah brand. This is reasonable because cosmetics are one of the tools to help lift physical performance to appear more attractive (Benefits and Mudarat Kosmetik, 2016), so consumers do not want to be wrong in choosing.

The influence of brand experience on brand satisfaction

The results of this study found that the brand experience or experience received by consumers from the Wardah brand was able to influence consumer satisfaction with the Wardah brand. The results of this study are in line with previous studies conducted by Chinomona (2013), Sahin, et al. (2011), Ali, et al. (2016) and Walter, et al. (2013), which state that strong and positive experiences will provide value and create satisfaction.

The highest average value from the frequency distribution of respondents’ answers shows that consumers are satisfied with some Wardah products. This shows that consumers feel the performance of Wardah cosmetics products in accordance with expectations and needs. In other words, Wardah has been able to present cosmetic products according to the characteristics and target consumers. Aside from the quality and function of the product, consumers also agree that they have received good service from Wardah beauty advisor, which has resulted in satisfaction for consumers. Service is part of the experience that consumers receive related to marketing communications and the form of the Wardah brand integrity to consumers.

The influence of brand experience on brand love

The results of this study found that the brand experience or experience received by consumers from the Wardah brand can directly influence consumers’ love for the Wardah brand. The results of this study confirm the findings of previous studies conducted by Biçakcioğlu, et al. (2016) and Huang (2017), which state that positive experiences received by consumers of a brand can strengthen emotional feelings or love for the brand.

The highest average value from the respondents’ frequency distribution shows that Wardah has a strong impression on the eyes of consumers and is a very good local brand. The average value of all statement items for the brand love variable also illustrates that consumers have a more intense emotional feeling towards the Wardah brand. This indicates that consumers have a positive evaluation of the Wardah brand in the form of consumer confidence regarding Wardah’s impression and superiority compared to other local cosmetic products. Positive impressions received by consumers from the Wardah brand then strengthen the emotional feelings of consumers, so consumers have strong confidence in the Wardah brand. Consumers know what they need and expect from the Wardah brand, then involve the integration of the brand into consumer identity, resulting in high emotional arousal towards the Wardah brand.

Effect of brand satisfaction on brand loyalty

The results of this study indicate that the satisfaction received by consumers from the Wardah brand directly affects consumer loyalty to the Wardah brand. The results of this study are in line with the results of previous studies conducted by Tu, et al. (2012), (Sahin, et al. (2011) and Nysveen, et al. (2014) which stated that brand satisfaction is one of the factors that significantly affects loyalty consumers of brands.
Based on the results of the average value of the five items of respondents’ frequency distribution responses on brand satisfaction, it illustrates that consumers get satisfaction because the Wardah brand can meet consumer expectations and needs both in terms of performance or product service. Consumers know what the Wardah brand can provide and how the company is committed to the Wardah principle. Therefore, Wardah must be consistent with being able to continue to generate satisfaction in the minds of consumers to create loyalty towards the Wardah brand. Satisfaction received by consumers from the Wardah brand will deliver consumers to consume the same brand again, spread positive information about Wardah, make Wardah the first choice when buying cosmetics, buy other products offered by Wardah, and are willing to pay a higher price.

The role of brand satisfaction as mediating the influence of brand experience on brand loyalty

Another finding in this study is that brand satisfaction has a mediating role in the relationship between the influence of brand experience on brand loyalty. In this study, brand experience has not been able to influence brand loyalty directly. But when mediated by brand satisfaction, the brand experience can be found to affect brand loyalty. In other words, brand satisfaction has a role as full mediation in accordance with the conditions presented by Hair, et al. (2010) in the previous sub-chapter.

Overall, the results of the respondents’ average scores regarding brand experience, brand satisfaction, and brand loyalty variables show that consumers agree that if they have a positive experience, have satisfaction with the Wardah brand and agree to reuse the Wardah brand. Consumers know what the Wardah brand can provide and feel how the company’s commitment to Wardah principles for consumers. Therefore, Wardah must be consistent in being able to guide consumers through experience and continue to generate satisfaction in the minds of consumers to create loyalty to the Wardah brand.

The role of brand love as mediating the influence of brand experience on brand loyalty

Another finding in this study is that brand love has a mediating role in the relationship between the influence of brand experience on brand loyalty. In this study, brand experience has not been able to influence brand loyalty directly. However, when mediated by brand love, brand experience is found to influence brand loyalty. In other words, brand love...
Cognitive-Affective Aspects of Forming Brand Loyalty

here has a role as full mediation in accordance with the terms delivered by Hair, et al. (2010) in the previous sub-chapter. Based on one of the reasons consumers choose Wardah is because all products released have halal content. Wardah was successful in creating a mindset in the minds of consumers as halal cosmetics and became one of the factors that gave its emotional attachment to consumers who needed a halal formula in their cosmetics. These feelings are positive feelings that arise because consumers have a great enthusiasm for Wardah, so that it impacts on consumer decisions to make Wardah the first choice when going to buy cosmetics. In addition to creating a halal mindset, Wardah increasingly positions itself as a prestigious brand and follows current trends. The innovation was used as a positive evaluation by Wardah consumers, giving rise to the belief that Wardah had the advantage compared to other brands, especially local brands. This raises an effective response which can then encourage Wardah consumers to consume the same brand again, spread positive information about Wardah, make Wardah the first choice when buying cosmetics, buy other products offered by Wardah, and are willing to pay higher prices.

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Conclusions

The brand experience received by consumers from Wardah has not been able to influence the brand loyalty of consumers towards Wardah directly. Brand satisfaction and brand love can mediate the influence of brand experience on brand loyalty significantly. In this study, brand satisfaction and brand love act as full mediation, meaning that without brand satisfaction and brand love, the brand experience cannot influence brand loyalty. Brand love is an effective aspect that is more dominant in influencing consumer loyalty.

Recommendations

Further research is suggested to explore further other independent variables related to cognitive aspects that are felt to affect loyalty directly, such as brand ambassadors, self-congruity, celebrity endorsement, and so on. It is important for Wardah management to continue to generate positive stimuli related to Wardah’s identity, packaging, marketing, and environmental communication where Wardah is marketed because these stimuli are a major aspect in forming long-term relationships with consumers. Wardah management is also advised to be consistent and continue to improve activities that can increase brand satisfaction and create a brand of love for consumers of Wardah users because it can create quality relationships which are an important aspect in building consumer loyalty to the Wardah brand.

REFERENCES


Sahin, A., Zehir, C., & Kitapçý, H. 2011. The effects of brand experiences, trust and satisfaction on building brand loyalty; an empirical research on global brands. Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences, 24, 1288-1301
