Perspective of Public Policy Change the Change of Minimum Wage Policy in South Sulawesi: an Analysis of Advocacy Coalition Framework

Muhammad Rusdi
Public Administration Department of Social and Political Science Faculty Hasanuddin University, Makassar

Abstract: Changing of minimum wage policy option by the actors in 2006 is caused mainly by any change from internal aspects of policy subsystem directly, especially the change of secondary aspects of two advocacy coalition of minimum wage in South Sulawesi. This case mainly influenced from implementation the decentralization aspect where labors or group of labors have also any opportunity to involve in wage policy debate or in the forum of board of Provincial Waging. Furthermore, the Board of Manpower (Dinas Tenaga Kerja) of South Sulawesi Province which is identified as the policy broker has an important role to meet policy subsystem's different strategies. As a result, conflict of minimum wage between labors and employers can reduce and they can act as a mediator to choose the wage policy.

Keywords: minimum wage, advocacy coalition framework

The policy analysis that insert an indicator of labor union as the role important in the context of labor policy choice have been the point of view of the scientist in 20th century. Nevertheless, stiglitz (2002); Jackson and Baldwin (2005) showed that many of the analysis did not explain how far the labor’s involved in wage policy can give change what they want.

Proposition which is explain that to enhance wage influenced by the more capacity of the society to press the bureaucracy or employer is still debatable. It is assumed by the analyst that enhancing wage always follow enhancing inflation (demand-side). For example, Courts (2004) concluded that this condition can not give positive effect of labor’s capacity in every where.

As long as the decade of 1990 to 2000an, theory and approach which have been used by the policy scientist tend to focus at both structural and hierarchie of the policy analysis. Those of approach was not catch the complex and dynamic situation in policy analysis. Moreover, the convensional approach based on iron triangle concept was not enough as an analysis of the policy where out of government institution involved in policy debate. (Gerston, 1983; deLeon, 2003).

Research on policy change is a more attractive field of study by the policy scientists since 1990an. Koch (2002) lihat Kemp, and Rifka (2005). In the relation to minimum wage policy, its problems why were the wage enhance and decided amount of 20%. How the policy forum and debate can approve the number of the wage. Finally, how advocacy coalition in context of minimum wage can decide the number, although they involved in high tension of conflict of interest in South Sulawesi Province.

In general, research which is observe on policy change tend to focus of some of factors determined of the policy change as analyzed by Rochefort dan Cobb (1993), degree of repressive for involving the labors in determining policy problems related to pension problems in Thailand by Ye Fuu (2001), Lopez-Santana (2003), Chowdury (2003), Anarita and Resmi (2003), Maria (2004), Rand Oakley (2003); Papadimitro (2001) and also Brendan (2004).

All of the research still not yet clearly explain how the policy actors or policy subsystem compete
each others by using their strategies to push and suggest to bureaucracy so as to their want comes true.

The early studied on political and windows approach to be done by Kingdon (1984, litar Parson, 1995). Kingdon found that all of decision makers always unknow the policy from where, especially how a policy problem rise and fall by the actors in the context of policy subsystem analysis. He assumed that in the relation to institution where the policy debate, so public opinion and political party will influence the policy.

Kingdon's approach (1984) related to evolutionary model toward public policy. He explained that policy formulation is a system which more adaptive and complex. It is assumed that all of agents in the policy area act for doing and create a change to surrounding area as described by Darwin. In other word, it is any combination in a good sense both idea and policy problems which will have evolve potentially. This is a causal model.

Policy network approach is an institutional formation which is built in all of public policy problems surrounding area and also to the program of government. This approach consist of variative actors both in their background and interest to policy resources. (Kickert, litar Peter, 2004). On the specific side, this approach is assumed as a frame of reference. According to Allison, 1971; Stewart, 1991, see Sobeck, 2003 can useful as the process for steering the actors in any network in the policy area for determining a policy problem who proposed it. Meanwhile, Atkinson and Coleman (1992) describe that the concept of policy network is a network which is fulfill by some instruments enough for counteracting the constraints to the state.

Recent decade in analyzing a policy is more dominate by stajiest approach or even structural one. Based on that, Sabatier, 1995 (see, Lindquist, 2001; Lester and Stewart, 2000) see that the analysis to ideas and information as an role part in analyzing a policy. Besides, it can change the policy itself.

In the relation to explain the phenomena of public policy change in any time, Sabatier and Jenkins-Smith (1993, see Brendan, 2002) develop a structural typology of the belief system as basis for working the advocacy coalition framework model. The belief system consist of three area of belief system.

Firstly, Deep/normative core which consist of personal aspect with their pylösosfical each other. Secondly, policy core which consist of the actors’ strategy and their policy position, so as to they can reach what they want of the policy. Finally, secondary aspect, which consist of the aspects can change the actors mind who involved in policy subsystem. This aspect tend to change easily.

Based on description above, advocacy coalition framework (ACF) show the role of values factor which is more strategies and even explicitly to be in policy change. There are some weaknesses of structural and institutional approach in describing the policy change, such as it is not able to identify some strategies factors in influence in a policy. Besides the approach reluctant of idea in policy process which is not suitable in policy based debate.

Moreover, ACF can explain the value conflict and deep core or the belief system of actors explicitly. It can grasp the opportunity of the policy subsystem in their relationship to push bureaucracy. Parson (1995) see that openness communication system occurs among policy actors or group of actors can give more good solution.

Finally, ACF more many explore to policy change which is caused by changing core belief systems of the actors or policy subsystem. It is occurs as an effect from policy learning by the policy subsystem along time with mediating by the policy brokers.

METHOD

This research is a qualitative research that based on post-positivism-phenomenologic-interpretive. (Muhadjir, 2000). The unit of analysis was policy subsystem of UMP where located in Makassar South Sulawesi consist of Labor unions, Employer association, expert-team and government. Meanwhile, the focus of analysis namely resources, strategy and policy learning of the policy subsystem to push the UMP policy change in UMP policy forum by using inductive approach.

The method of analysis to be applied by grounded research through some of stages, namely open coding, axial coding and also selective coding. In the final description is to construct some proposition about of the findings.
FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Research results showed that there were four actors who involved in the process of minimum wages policy in the Provincial Waging Board (DPW). They are notion to tripartit plus which consist of the labor union, employer association, the bureaucracy and expert team from higher education. The fourth of the group have the legitimate for analyzing, negotiating and also formulating the policy of provincial wage. It is made by them and taking over to governor for adoption as a provincial regulation.

The other aspects to be found from the perspective of belief system of the policy subsystem in DPW South Sulawesi Province presented as follows:

The change of minimum wage policy (UMP) through the intensively discussion at the process of UMP formulation, listening the demands and proposals of employee (Apindo). In this case, labors union demand UMP in 2006 up to Rp. 700,000, while Apindo propose Rp. 600,000 is very low.

The reality of debating of the two groups in related to wage system relatively raise some different strategies for influence the UMP decision before decided. In this case, both of the group of actors influence the bureaucracy with their strategies respectively.

Internal and External Factors of Policy Subsystem

Internal Factors

Statement about that union labors as a miniature for building organization SP (union labor) is true. In this case, most of them to be done by the SP itself in district/town (kabupaten/kota) level and besides DPC (Dowon Pinangin Cabang). The material for training namely basics of organization, property/ welfare of the labors, conflict resolution and audit internal systems. In the relation of building capacity aspect of the labor unions have been felt by the labors as to be stated by Tjandrayana through an interview that: ......as long as to be done by the SP/ SB or the federation of the labors toward of all of SP-TP which is become their federation itself is more adequate as the first step in enhancing local knowledge of the labors. Its starting to build capacity and trying to enhance their welfare. However, until to now nearly all of the building capacity aspects not giving a positive effects yet of the labors strike for enhancing their position in the relation of the employer. (interview, 05/01/2006).

Based on research result above it can be understood that there is a polarization and fragmentation of the issues, ideology and also labors’ move. It is also suitable for local autonomy era where the labors have a good bargaining position. On the other hand, united of the labors must able to build an agenda that the labors have a good solidarity and solidarity in the context of labors’ strikes and free-unified.

The external factors

In relation to local autonomy and free-unified by the labors it is a real time for enhancing a good bargaining position of the labors to the government. The forum of labors united (SPSI) have been proposed so as pancasila industrial relation (HIP) must

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Advocacy Coalition</th>
<th>belief system dimension</th>
<th>Change relatively</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employer Association (Apindo)</td>
<td>Investment to be needed by the government</td>
<td>Wage is determined by the labor’s productivity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Union labor (Serikat Buruh)</td>
<td>The labors have an important role in the production process</td>
<td>The labour cost still lower (5%-7% of the total of production cost)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Source: data of Interview, 2006)
be reorientation. It is caused by the concept is not suitable for local autonomy era until now. The forum of SPSI want that industrial relation in this era must have a new paradigm.

Ruslan as chief of waging and welfare section of Disnaker South Sulawesi Province in relation to impact of changing a government system from centralistic to decentralized that:

"...as a decentralization had affected the process of minimum wage policy (UMP) formulation such as the total of wage and also value of suitable live it is done by the DPP on behalf of the Governor. It is determined by the governor as well as the legislative board. The perspective above give a clearly effect in the era of autonomy where local authority able to formulate the value of UMP. This case will enhance labors' wage which always appropriate of labors' life through the KHL survey. (Wawancara, 09/02/2006).

If we compare to observation results in relation to analysis of policy subsystem of UMP in DPP forum of South Sulawesi showed that although local autonomy policy gave a sovereign of the local authority such Governor level for determine UMP in their location, in general all of labors' strike for changing wage values as to be wanted by the labors not influenced significantly. The case is right as to be commented by FNPBI through a strike in the front of the office of manpower South Sulawesi Province that:

"...we are as labors group demanded a rising the UMP until 100% of UMP before and also added suitable to the rate of inflation of 14% which is caused by the effect of rising cost of migas (BBM) in 2005. Besides, there is an evidence that many employers have the labor cost is lower than the extra that will be give to bureaucracy. (Orasi the chairman of FNPBI, 12/10/2005).

It is assumed that there are some role of mass media to blow-up the minimum wage conditions more realistic even in strike time. It occurs in September and October every year. This case is more related to the process and determination of minimum wage which clearly more involve a negotiating, conflicting and also compromising. Moreover, the Fajar newspaper always publish the PHK accident to be done by the employers with their argumentation of labors}


divorce. This is has a significant effect to labors position.

Empirically, in 2005 the value of inflation of South Sulawesi Province tends to rise which 14% a year that it is approximately 9-12% a year before. This case occurs increase simultaneously the cost of primary cost of living at the first and the last quartal in Indonesia in 2005.

If we further analyze it means that the labors' successful in the relation to wage policy in South Sulawesi more dominantly caused by mass strike than negotiation and lobby. Strategy which focus to mobilize the mass or strike have been a power by the labors as their hero. Nevertheless, in relation to the process of policy formulation of UMP in 2006, so the labors always handycrafted at the implementation of negotiation dimension. It argue that the negotiation is one of the important instrument for increasing the trust of policy actors in UMP policy forum.

The Strategy of Advocacy Coalition in Pushing the Policy Change of UMP

Labors Union Actor

In general according to my observation that labors group have the best strategy is strike. From this scheme labors always blow-up their demand such as their wage and prosperity in context of production process until now.

It is found that in the technical perspective wage policy is a policy that must real living cost of the labors. Further analysis by Ruslan as the section leader of wage and manpower prosperity of South Sulawesi that:

"...for knowing about the need of the labors it is not surely only observation to the the need of the labors but also to do well-research and spontaneously related to labors' need in the field at the time of formulation of wage policy in South Sulawesi in 2006 (Wawancara, 19/12/2005).

Due to the price that is observed by the actors nearly at the number as their perception and interest respectively. This case cause there is a change to evaluate the KHL indicator, especially from the side of some items in KHL composition itself. The ability of policy subsystem for existence the value of KHL which is more realistic and it is determined by the
method of taking goods sample that is observed and carefully to count survey result. KHL indicator that realistic is just earned at all of sources that involve in survey of KHL is having the same perception and locality too.

On the other hands, there was some problems at located to inability of the labors to know the corporation development, both in progressive or unprogressive. The factor is stated by Tjandrayana as a representative of labor union that:

in general, employer can state easily that their corporation is decline but in fact it never state about how far their revenue along time, especially to the labors. As result we are as labor union felt there was one of nothing and unfair and also intransparency to their surrounding area. This is also too related with the labor union existence for knowing corporation condition where they are worked. (Interview, 05/01/2006).

In principle, labour union willing to transparency by the corporation or to represent their accountability in using their budget, especially related to labor cost. Furthermore, the labor union in the implementation of minimum wage program as like that always toward at the problems of their capability which is not able relatively to show up their excellences. This case is also occur if we relate to process of policy formulation the number of wage is determined suitable to the reality living cost of the labors.

The Strategy of Employer Association (Apindo)

In the context and the process of UMP negotiation in 2006, Apindo coalition more use their internal strategies both in negotiation and lobby in related to the process of formulation of UMP policy. In some of patron and existence of the negotiation and lobby which is used by Apindo coalition in DPP forum have been stated by Edgar Paljurang act as a member of Apindo and member of DPP that:

...... all of the process of debating and negotiating UMP we always apply negotiation and lobby in the forum DPP for enhancing our trust related to our proposal of the UMP in 2006. This case is caused by the process of negotiation along time is successfull we done at least to press the labor union pressure about the number of wage their propose. Nevertheless, the process of negotiation and lobby mechanism which is done by the Apindo is less effective for pressing the policy subsystem for bringing it to their want about of nominal of UMP in 2006. (Interview, 20/12/2006).

The problems of the relation between policy actors in the context of policy subsystem in DPP along the time of debating UMP in 2006 more based on institutional than personal. Although in some cases there were personal relation in out of meeting about UMP. This case mainly meant that to sharp and light the propose of UMP which willing the all of actors. But it is found that the negotiation individual based is more effective than institution one, especially is out of time debating. It means that actors relation in out of policy subsystem more effective to push the all of actors and also influence the perception of actors in DPP forum simultaneously.

Aspect of Policy Learning

This research observed about the activity of the demonstran which is done by FNPBFI thorough oral speech as a part of their strike by the labor union. This strike is done for equal the relation between employer and local government along this time especially for doing the process of negotiation and debating about UMP 2006 in DPP forum. Based on the observation we concluded that:

......the labor union always to concern to the issues of less of number of minimum wage from employer to the labors. This issues which can build the labors’ struggle in DPP forum. The reason of Apindo refuse the increasing of UMP 2006 must minimum as about of the result of DPP’s survey. This case is according to the labor is more still big by the non technical cost related to the production process such as biaya sifitam that the number can reach of 25-30% of the production process cost. As a result, employer feel is bigger than before if the UMP 2006 is also increase. Furthermore, the labor union felt that this case tactic only of Apindo for divorce their obedience. (oral speech of FNPBFI 28/10/2005).

In implementing of survey of living feasibility which is done by DPP sometime was not reflect to a reality of life of the labors practically or insuitable of the real condition that observed.

On the next stage this strategy became the matter of learning by the labors in doing calculation independently and more adequate suitable to their real of living expenses. The process like that in some perspectives
is the reality of learning process in long time which to
done by the labors. At least to rearrange their inter-
ral problems themselves. and also marginalization of the
labors from employer’s strategy.

The Role of Policy Broker

Toward of a conflictive situation of two coalition
advocacy related to minimum wage such as descrip-
tion above so that the government’s strategy as a
policy broker of the conflictive situation is more stra-
egist for solving their problem, especially for bridging
the gap.

The function of the policy broker is act by the
head of Manpower Provincial Office and the Secre-
tary of DPP through a discussion strategy toward
some materials of speech of the two advocacy coal-
ition in conflictive area.

The method for conflict resolution of the two
advocacy coalition mainly related to the change of
the value of nominal minimum wage in DPP forum.
This case is stated by one of policy broker from
Disnaker South Sulawesi Province is Ruslan who also
a leader of waging and welfare section of Disnaker
South Sulawesi Province in general using a persua-
sive strategy. This strategy seem could reduce the
conflict tension of two advocacy coalition in DPP
forum to decide UMP 2006. Ruslan stated that:

The description about the role of policy bro-
ker, so that yield of the compromising number about
20% increasing of UMP of 2005. It is visualized as
follows:

The ability of the coalition advocacy as the other
aspects of the waging institution showed that it is still
limiter relatively of SP coalition in some area of DPP
forum to debate. The ability for negotiating and
lobbying that very important for influence the policy
subsystem of UMP policy making is not significantly
yet as to be own of the labors. Futhermore, in the
process of policy debating is not show of the labors’
ability yet in negotiation and in describing their pre-
ference of UMP 2006.

The logic consequences of these is in general
the using the mass strike mechanism still dominantly
to be used by the labors is still using of the context of
to push their wants of the UMP 2006 rather than of
communication in the process of DPP forum. Although
demonstration to be done by the labors continuously
But negotiation and lobby and also argumentation is still dominate of the context of policy making arena of UMP 2006.

From the perspective above we can understand that in effective to decision of tension conflict of actors is determined by the language and power to push the policy subsystem. It is argue that the concept of Torgeson (see, Jenny, 2005) that the context of language and also the power is influence the policy making arena is true and related to my finding.

Based on description of finding above it can be concluded as a propotion that:

**Minor Propotion (1):**

The ability of advocacy coalition institution in negotiation and lobby and also argumentation to the value of UMP more dominant to determine of the process policy making of UMP than demonstration.

The process of debating of minimum wage policy which is acted by the SB tend to grasp by the labors in the frame for toward the employer in all of situation. One their strategy is deadlock in the time of debating of UMP. It is the process just only of minimum wage debating could not give a best solution as the labors want. Althought this strategy give a little change of UMP 2006 of the perception of the labors.

Grindle and Thomas’ analysis (1991) who implied that in the developing countries interest groups can not to rearrange their capacity well for pushing the elite of the policy is relevant of this research. This evidencial support the finding that advocacy coalition of the labors can not reach their want related of UMP 2006 especially in the forum DPP.

It is also relevant of this research is concept of Sabatier and Jenkins-Smith (1993, see Lindquist, 2001) that there was anything advocacy coalition or policy
subsystem which dominant relatively to determine the public policy. Nevertheless, from the core belief system of the advocacy coalition will control to the process of public policy. Meanwhile the minor advocacy coalition continuously to protect of and doing the learning process along the time is relevant to this research.

In the relation to policy broker and the actors' perception (advocacy coalition) they seem play an effective role for changing the employer's belief system. The policy broker was successful to do their function with their strategies to blow-up the fairness and welfare and inflation 2005 issues. This findings is relevant to Johnson, F. Collen (2002) research result that policy broker can give an effective role to change the energy policy in Ecuador. Although the labors' demand for enhancing the minimum wage 2006 where 29.25% of UMP 2005 of the labors and 13.42 % of the employer as the strongest impact from the inflation 2005, the policy broker successfull to change the belief of policy subsystems till reach 20% up UMP in 2006 from 2005. It is through negotiation whose is played by the policy broker.

On the other word, the external issues which related to social economic condition such as inflation and effect of decentralization are not influence the provincial minimum wage option by the actors directly. It is argue that it still be stimulated by the role of policy broker. This finding related to Burnett and Davis, research (2002) that the idea of the change of policy was stimulated by the policy broker. In this case the role of policy broker seem more become a mediator than a facilitator. On the other hand, the research result of Rand, Oakley (2003) that the legislative's leadership factor is still dominant to influence the option of festsida policy in Delaware USA is not relevant of this research.

Based on the description above we can conclude a proposition that:

Minor Proposition (2):
Although the pluralist context of process of wage policy making but advocacy coalition which their member is more adequate is still dominate of the whole process of the policy making arena.

Concept of domination in the process of policy making tend to still occur if there is a different total of members of advocacy coalition in the policy subsystem and their existenc in DPP forum. This case give implication to pluralist approach of policy making strategies as stated by Trumun (1951, see Grindle, 1991) where the operational concept which is determined by the number of actors and members of actors.

On the other hand that concept and approach which describe to aspect of belief and values and ideas is the important dimension in process of policy making. (Presman dan Wildavsky, 1973; Wildavsky, 1987, see Grindle, 1991 and Majone, 1980, see Rochefort and Cobb, 1993) is relevant to used as descriptor in this research.

Based of the description above I concluded the proposition that:

Minor Proposition (3):
The change of the instrument of the policy subsystem belief of KHM become KHL more because of change of government system more decentralistic.

The role of policy broker in giving suggestion of the policy subsystem is the best challenge in the policy subsystem. At the one step of the process of policy making arena of UMP that mass-media is more effective to blow-up the reality of labors livelihood in policy subsystem.

Based on description above so I concluded and having building a proposition that:

Minor Proposition (4):
Although mass-media influenced directly the perception of the policy subsystem, but the process of UMP policy choose is stimulated still by the negotiation mechanism in DPP forum.

The implication of socio-economy factors in the process of UMP policy change could not separate from a reality that context of stability of socio-economy tend to yield the policy which support socio-economy itself. The UMP policy change which is done by the policy subsystem also factually because of the context of socio-economy that is in there are of formulation.

The inflation effect as cause of increase the price of BBM also convincly give effect to the UMP
policy change in 2006 which is chose by the actors. Having increasing the inflation value about 14% until 2005 that is caused by the effect from increasing the price of BBM in South Sulawesi Province in general and spontaneously to increase the price of the primary goods of the labors. So that this case practically all of actors must search a suitable price for KHL value for formulation and determine UMP policy.

In the contrary of the both of the approach above also reflect from Heclo's analysis (1974); Hofferbert (1974) who found that sociological and economical factors only give a little portion to policy change analysis. As Heclo argument that the other factors to policy development and change is derived from the learning process that is done by the expert of the policy itself.

It means that we can determine a proposition that:

**Minor Proposition (5):**

Although there are a way of method for policy options, such as the value of KHL (need for appropriate live) but the role of the institution that will determine the wage policy is still dominan both in negotiation and bargaining process of the policy subsystem.

It is concluded that the mechanism of the policy change more patron in the relation between internal and external factors of the policy subsystem as stated in ACF approach (Sabatier, 1993, see Lindquist, 2001) and also not change naturally as stated in punctuated equilibrium approach (Baughmgartner, 2000) and political stream approach (Kingdon, 1988).

The finding above also related to Heclo's conclusion (1974) dan Hofferbert (1974) see Grindle (1991) that factor of socio-economy have mainly influence to process of policy formulation as we analyze in UMP policy. This yield of the change which is assumed as perceptional change of the actors as a heart of analysis in ACF theory.

Composition of public opinion that existence in blow-up by the mass-media is relevant to the concept of public opinion who comment by Howkett and Ramash (1995); Ripley (1985); Portz (1996); and also Cobb and Elder (1993). Meanwhile, the implication of technological factors is not suitable of this research because there was no convince indication that technological aspect determined the change of UMP policy in South Sulawesi Province.

**Implication:**

This research have been gave the best contribution to the frame of main theory to be used that is the ACF theory through the construction methods (model reconstruction) who found by Sabatier in 1990s. (Sabatier and Jenkins-Smith, 1993, see Lindquist, 2001). Although, the theory concen to the process of policy change in the perspective of core belief, policy core and secondary aspect from policy subsystem perspective that change in over time, but this research results with take a case of provincial minimum wage (UMP) in South Sulawesi Province. This change is showed from nominal value of policy subsystem choose.

The found of this research give also to contribute the hierachical of the change of policy belief system. It is argue that the change occur is not hierarchically but naturally. The negotiation aspect that will tend more dominant effect to the option of the actors in the board of provincial wage also gave a positive contribution to the theory of ACF, especially to complete the analysis of institutional perspective as to be analyzed by Olson (1971). It is also reflect to Eastonian analysis (see, Gerston, 1983) that policy change occurs in any iron triangle concept.

Based on the description above it is conclude that there are some area of research which can be further analyzed. In this case, it is very important to see about how do structurisation and policy belief system of the actors can influence the policy change over time. The others, it need to be studied the ACF theory out of the labor perspective which based on conflictive scheme to choice of the policy, such as the field of forestry, urban military policy. All of the field is still more attractive to further analyze in ACF perspective.

**CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTION**

**Conclusion**

In fact, the choice of strategy that is used by the policy subsystem more effective for effect the context and formulation of the minimum wage policy in
Makassar. Lobby mechanism between labor union (SP) and employer association (Apindo) have difference each other. In general, Apindo is more using negotiation mechanism out of debate room of UMP while labor union more heroic to strike and repressive to the bureaucracy so as to their want come true.

Suggestion

The role and function of the policy broker who is played by the Board of Manpower Provincial in South Sulawesi in DPP forum have been steer the change of UMP. This is change from Labor union perspective and also employer association in every time or every where they meet in a forum of DPP. Although UMP always meet debate of the policy subsystem, the policy broker can play their role effectively to meet difference proposal of UMP both of Apindo and SP.

REFERENCE

Allison, G. 1971. Essence for Decision: Explaining the Cuban Missile Crisis, Boston, Little-Brown Publisher.